

INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

A PRACTICAL APPROACH

Javaid Rehman



We work with leading authors to develop the strongest educational materials in law, bringing cutting-edge thinking and best learning practice to a global market.

Under a range of well-known imprints, including Longman, we craft high quality print and electronic publications which help readers to understand and apply their content, whether studying or at work.

To find out about the complete range of our publishing please visit us on the World Wide Web at:
www.pearsoneduc.com

INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

A PRACTICAL APPROACH

Javaid Rehman

SENIOR LECTURER IN HUMAN RIGHTS AND PUBLIC LAW,
UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS



An imprint of Pearson Education

Harlow, England · London · New York · Reading, Massachusetts · San Francisco
Toronto · Don Mills, Ontario · Sydney · Tokyo · Singapore · Hong Kong · Seoul
Taipei · Cape Town · Madrid · Mexico City · Amsterdam · Munich · Paris · Milan

Pearson Education Limited

Edinburgh Gate
Harlow
Essex CM20 2JE
England

and Associated Companies around the world

Visit us on the World Wide Web at:
www.pearsoneduc.com

First published 2003

© Pearson Education Limited 2003

The right of Javed Rehman to be identified as the author of
this work has been asserted by him in accordance with
the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved; no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored
in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic,
mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise without either the prior
written permission of the Publishers or a licence permitting restricted copying
in the United Kingdom issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency Ltd,
90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP.

ISBN 0 582 43773 3

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book can be obtained from the British Library.

1 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

0 5 8 2 4 3 7 7 3 3

Typeset by 68

in 10/13pt Sabon

Printed in Great Britain by Henry Ling Ltd
at the Dorset Press, Dorchester, Dorset

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xxxi
<i>Table of Other Documents</i>	xxxvii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xl

OVERVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW: THEORY AND PRACTICE

Human Rights of the Individual in International Law	1
Structure of the Book	3
Some Recurrent Themes	5
Universalism and regionalism	5
Interdependence of human rights	6
The scope of human rights law – individual and minority rights	7
The public/private divide in human rights law	8

PART I INTERNATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEM AND HUMAN RIGHTS

1 INTERNATIONAL LAW AND HUMAN RIGHTS	13
Introduction	13
Nature and Definition of International Law	14
Characteristics of International Law	14
Sources of International Law	15
International conventions	16
International customary law	19
General principles of law	20
Subsidiary sources of international law	21
Additional sources of international law	22
<i>Jus Cogens</i> and Human Rights Law	22

2	THE UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM AND THE MODERN HUMAN RIGHTS REGIME (1945-)	24
	Introduction	24
	Limitations of the Charter	26
	The General Assembly	28
	The Security Council	31
	The Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC)	34
	The Commission on Human Rights and the Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights	35
	The Commission on the Status of Women	45
	International Court of Justice	46
	The Trusteeship Council	47
	The Secretariat	48
	PART II THE INTERNATIONAL BILL OF RIGHTS	
3	THE UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	53
	Introduction	53
	Range of Rights Contained and the Rationale for International Consensus	55
	Nature of Obligations and Relevance for Human Rights Practitioner	57
	UDHR as an authoritative interpretation of the Charter	57
	UDHR as part of customary international law	58
	UDHR binding States with its <i>Jus cogens</i> character	61
	INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS	62
	Introduction	62
	The International Covenants and the Right to Self-Determination	65
	General Nature of Obligations	66
	Analysis of Substantive Rights	68
	The right to life, prohibition of torture and the issues concerning capital punishment	68
	Rights to liberty and security of person, prohibitions of arbitrary detentions and unfair trials	74
	Rights to privacy, freedom of expression, conscience, opinion, assembly and association	77
	The interaction between principles of equality and non-discrimination with minority rights	80
	The Human Rights Committee	83

The Reporting Procedure	84
Reporting guidelines	86
General Comments	87
Inter-State Applications	88
The Individual Complaints Procedure	89
Admissibility requirements under the Optional Protocol	92
Admissibility and procedural requirements connected with the content of the petition	97
Other admissibility requirements	100
Conclusions	101
5 THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS	104
Introduction	104
Arguments Over the Superiority of Rights	105
General Nature of Obligations: Progressive Realisation of Rights	107
Self-Determination and Economic and Social Rights	109
Analysis of the Structure and Substantive Rights	111
The right to work and rights of workers	112
Social security and family rights	115
Adequate standard of living and mental and physical health	116
Education rights	119
Cultural rights	122
Implementation Machinery	123
Aims and objectives of the state reporting system	125
Procedure	126
Innovative Procedures ²²	128
Conclusions	131
PART III REGIONAL PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	
6 EUROPEAN HUMAN RIGHTS – I	135
Introduction	135
The Council of Europe and Protection of Civil and Political Rights	136
Rights contained in the Convention	138
Analysis of Substantive Rights	139
The right to life and the prohibition of torture, cruel, inhuman, degrading treatment or punishment	139
The right to liberty and security	146
The right to fair trial	148
Privacy, family life, home and correspondence	150

Freedoms of religion, expression, assembly and association	153
Non-discrimination issues under the Convention	155
Institutional Mechanisms and Implementation	
Machinery	155
Complaints Procedure under Protocol 11	156
Preliminary procedures	156
Complaints procedure	156
Post-admissibility procedures	157
Inter-State Applications	158
Individual Complaints	159
<i>Ratione personae</i>	160
Complaints against whom?	160
Requirement of victim	161
Competence <i>ratione materiae</i>	162
Competence <i>ratione loci</i>	162
Exhaustion of domestic remedies	163
Six months rule	164
Other restrictions	164
Remedies before the Court	165
Significant Principles Emergent from the ECHR	166
Reservations: Article 57	166
Derogation in time of emergency: Article 15	166
Margin of appreciation	167
Conclusions	167
EUROPE AND HUMAN RIGHTS – II	169
Introduction	169
European Social Charter 1961	170
Rights contained within the ESC	171
Implementation mechanism	174
The European Union	178
Institutional structures and protection of human rights	180
European Court of Justice and human rights	182
Human rights and the EU treaties	185
The Charter of Fundamental Rights	189
Critical comments	195
The OSCE	196
Human rights involvement through visits	200
High Commissioner for National Minorities	201
Conclusions	201

8	THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	203
	Introduction	203
	The OAS Charter System and the American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man	205
	The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	207
	Background: one Commission for the two systems	207
	Structure and organisation of the Commission	209
	Complaints procedure	211
	The American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR)	211
	Analysis of Substantive Rights	213
	Right to life, liberty, the prohibition of enforced disappearances and torture	213
	Equality and non-discrimination	215
	Privacy, religion, thought, expression, assembly and association	217
	Specialist rights	217
	Economic, social and cultural rights	219
	Procedures under the American Convention on Human Rights	219
	State reporting	219
	Individual complaints procedure	220
	Inter-State application	221
	Admissibility requirements	221
	Procedure	224
	The Inter-American Court of Human Rights	225
	Forms of Jurisdiction	226
	Contentious jurisdiction	226
	Advisory jurisdiction	230
	Fact Finding Missions of the Inter-American Commission	233
	Conclusions	233
9	AFRICAN CHARTER ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS	235
	Introduction	235
	Distinctive Features of the Charter	237
	Incorporation of three generations of rights	237
	Duties of the individual	238
	'Claw-back' clauses	238
	Analysing the Substantive Rights in the Charter	239
	Non-discrimination and equality	240
	Right to life and prohibitions of torture and slavery	242
	Freedom of religion, expression, association and movement	244
	Property rights in the Charter	245
	Economic, social and cultural rights	246

The Meaning of Peoples' Rights in the African Human Rights Law	248
The African Commission	252
Protecting Human and Peoples' Rights	254
State reporting procedure	254
Inter-State procedure	255
Other communications	256
Article 58 communications	260
Procedure	261
Analysis of the Commission's Work and the Probable Contributions of the African Court of Human Rights	262
Conclusions	264
 PART IV GROUP RIGHTS 	
10 EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION	269
Introduction	269
Equality and Non-Discrimination within International Law	270
Religious Discrimination and International Law	271
Inconsistencies within International Standards and Difficulties in Implementation	273
Right to Racial Equality and Non-Discrimination in International Law	280
The international Covenants	280
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (the Race Convention)	281
The Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD)	289
Conclusions	294
11 THE RIGHTS OF MINORITIES	297
Introduction	297
Definition of Minorities	298
Analysing the Substantive Rights of Minorities	303
Right to life and physical existence	303
The right to religious, cultural and linguistic autonomy	311
Modern Initiatives in International Law	315
Regional Protection of Minority Rights: An Overview	319
Conclusions	323

12	THE RIGHTS OF 'PEOPLES' AND 'INDIGENOUS PEOPLES'	325
	Introduction	325
	Peoples' Right to Self-Determination	326
	Indigenous Peoples in International Law: The Issue of Definition	331
	Rights of Indigenous Peoples	334
	Indigenous Peoples and the UN System	337
	Other Initiatives	340
	Conclusions	342
13	THE RIGHTS OF <u>WOMEN</u>	344
	Introduction	344
	Rights of Women and the Human Rights Regime	346
	Combating Gender-Based Discrimination and the International Human Rights Movement	347
	The Role of the United Nations	349
	The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women	350
	Issues of discrimination and of de facto equality	351
	Representation in public life and the issue of nationality	355
	Educational, employment and health rights	357
	Social and economic rights	358
	Marriage and family relations	361
	Reservations and the Attempts to Find Consensus on the Provisions of the Convention	362
	The Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (<u>CEDAW</u>)	363
	General recommendations	367
	Procedure	368
	Recent initiatives	369
	Violence Against Women	370
	Conclusions	373
14	<u>RIGHTS OF THE CHILD</u>	376
	Introduction	376
	International Instruments on the Rights of the Child	378
	The Convention on the Rights of the Child	379
	Analysing the Substantive Provisions	380
	Definitional issues and the obligations of States parties to non-discrimination	380
	Best interest of the child	382
	Developmental rights of the child	384
	Children and their freedom of expression, association and religion	386

Measures to combat violence, abuse, exploitation and maltreatment of children	388
Children in wars and conflicts	392
Concerns of disability and health	393
Educational rights	395
Criminal justice rights	397
Implementation of the Convention	397
Innovative Features and Other Initiatives	401
Conclusions	402

PART V CRIMES AGAINST THE DIGNITY OF MANKIND

15 TORTURE AS A CRIME IN INTERNATIONAL LAW AND THE RIGHTS OF TORTURE VICTIMS	407
Introduction	407
✓ The Convention Against Torture (Torture Convention)	410
Provisions contained in the Convention	411
Defining the concept of 'torture', 'cruel' 'inhuman' or 'degrading treatment' or 'punishment'	412
Non-expulsions and torture Convention	415
Torture and the issues of sovereign immunity and universal jurisdiction	419
✓ The Committee Against Torture (CAT)	422
Implementation Mechanisms	423
Reporting procedures	424
Procedure for the Consideration of reports	425
Inter-State procedure	426
Individual Complaints procedure	427
Investigation on its own initiative (Article 20)	430
The UN Special Rapporteur, the Question of the Rights of Torture Victims and Other Initiatives taken by the UN	432
Conclusions	435
16 TERRORISM AS A CRIME IN INTERNATIONAL LAW	437
Introduction	437
The Definitional Issues	439
Terrorism: a working definition	443
Terrorism and International Law	443
International Efforts to Formulate Legal Principles	446
Prohibiting All Forms of Terrorism	446
The inter-war years 1919-1939	446
Post-1945 developments	446

Ending of the cold war and shift in policies	448
Dealing with specific terrorist activities	450
UN Conventions	452
Regional Conventions	454
Aerial terrorism	456
Maritime terrorism	459
International Legal Developments since 11 September and Difficulties Related to Compensation for Victims of International Terrorism	461
Conclusions	464
Appendix I: Sources and Further Research in human rights	466
Appendix II: Status of the Ratification of the Principal International and Regional Human Rights Treaties	468
Index	483

Raisu L

sourav.mellick@gmail.com

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The growth and expansion of international human rights law has been truly remarkable. Within a very short time, international human rights law has acquired an important position in legal studies, both at undergraduate and postgraduate levels. The subject has also acquired great relevance for practitioners, and for those representing States, intergovernmental and non-governmental organisations. While human rights law has expanded dramatically, it is surprising (and disappointing) to note that there is a shortage of books and other materials which provide a simple and straightforward analysis of this subject. I first became aware of such a lacuna when I was invited by the University of Peshawar, in association with the Governments of Pakistan and Norway, to teach on a human rights course for the inaugural session of the Human Rights Centre in Peshawar, Pakistan during March–April 2000. Upon my return to the United Kingdom, I was encouraged by many colleagues, friends and students to write a detailed textbook on this subject.

Many people have helped and supported me in writing this book. I am most thankful to Professor John Bell (University of Cambridge) Professor Asif Qureshi (University of Manchester), Siobhan Mullally (University College Cork) and Dr Shaheen Sardar Ali (University of Warwick) for their constant encouragement and for reading the chapters of the book. Professor John Bell's comment have been extremely useful not only in improving the quality of individual chapters, but have also proved instrumental in reshaping the structure and presentation of my ideas. I would also like to thank the reviewers who read the initial draft chapters and provided very encouraging and useful comments for further improvements.

I am also very grateful to a number of colleagues currently working at the University of Leeds for reading parts of the book. I would like to particularly thank Professor Clive Walker, Chloe Wallace, Clare Furniss, Amrita Mukherjee and Penny Robinson for their analysis and extremely positive comments on various chapters. I would like to thank Yaman Akdeniz for his technical computing assistance in completing this study. Maria Eugenia Freitas (currently completing a post-graduate degree at Leeds Metropolitan University) very kindly read through the notes and helped me with their style and referencing. I am very grateful to her for her time and kindness. I would also like to thank my PhD student, Kerem Altıparmak, for updating the case references. Emily Hearn, another of my former students, read through the entire text to eliminate linguistic or grammatical errors; I am grateful to her for this kindness. Having said that, I remain of course responsible for all this work; its inadequacies and imperfections rest solely with me.

In addition to the actual reading of the draft chapters and assistance with the writing of the book, I remain in debt to several colleagues for their overall support and

encouragement. A particular debt is owed to Professor Sally Wheeler (former Head of the Department of Law, University of Leeds) for her kindness, support and for her enormous efforts in developing my academic career. I would like to thank Professor Jo Shaw (University of Manchester) for her support and encouragement. Professor Adam Crawford from the Leeds Law Department also very generously supported me in my research. I am very grateful to Caroline Busiman (Law School, University of Westminster) for her kindness and support. My special thanks to Pat Bond, Jill Birch and the copy-editors at Pearson Education for their enormous help and support in completing this study.

Finally, and most importantly I would like to thank my parents for their patience, understanding and love – I would like to dedicate this book to them.

I have tried to state the law as it stood at the beginning of 2002, and where possible up until 31 March 2002.

Javaid Rehman
University of Leeds
March 2002